BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
31761 06090915 7

THE SUPREME COURT AND THE CHARTER

VOLUME II

PRESIDENT AHARON BARAK
PROFESSOR DIETER GRIMM
MR. JUSTICE FRANK IACOBUCCI

University of Toronto - Faculty of Law
Law 433H1F

September 2003

Storage
KE
4381.5
.B36
2003
v.2
c.1

THE SUPREME COURT AND THE CHARTER

VOLUME II

PRESIDENT AHARON BARAK
PROFESSOR DIETER GRIMM
MR. JUSTICE FRANK IACOBUCCI

University of Toronto - Faculty of Law
Law 433H1F

September 2003

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/supremecourtchar02bara

The Supreme Court and the Charter
Table of Contents

Volume I

Chapter 1: The Countermajoritarian Problem

F L. Morton & Rainer Knopff, *The Charter Revolution and the Court Party* (Peterborough, Ont.. Broadview Press, 2000), Chapter 2 — 1

The Hon. Jus. Frank Iacobucci, "The Relationship Between Courts and Legislatures" (Notes for Keynote address: Continuing Legal Education Programs) Edmonton, Alberta May 17, 2000 [unpublished] — 15

Stephen Breyer, "Judicial Review: a Practising Judge's Perspective"(1999) 19 Ox. J. Leg Stud. 153. — 47

Jus. Aharon Barak, "The Role of the Supreme Court in a Democracy"(1999) 33 Is. L. Rev. 1. — 54

Jus. B. M. McLachlin, "The Charter: a New Role for the Judiciary?" (1991) 29 Alta. L. Rev. 540 — 66

Jus. Bertha Wilson, "The Making of a Constitution: Approaches to Judicial Interpretation" (1998) Public Law 370. — 71

The Hon. Dieter Grimm, "Constitutional Adjudication and Democracy" in Mads Andenas and Duncan Fairgrieve, eds., *Judicial Review in International Perspective* (London: Kluwer Law International, 2000) 103. — 79

United Mizrahi Book Case (1995), Supreme Court of Israel, Opinion of the President of the Court, Justice Aharon Barak (excerpt) — 89

Further Readings — 99

Chapter 2: Hate Speech

R. v. *Keegstra*, [1990] 3 S.C.R. 697 in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School). — 101

R.A.V. v. *City of St. Paul*, 112 S.Ct. 2538 (1992), Supreme Court of the United States, in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School) — 123

Holocaust Denial Case, (1994) 1 BvR 23/94, Constitutional Court of Germany, in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School) — 143

Soldiers are Murderers Case, (1995) 1 BvR 1476, Constitutional Court of Germany 152

The 'Kach' Case, 41(3) PD 255 (1987), Supreme Court of Israel 173

Further Readings 190

CHAPTER 3: SEXUAL ORIENTATION

Vriend v. *Alberta*, [1998] 1 S.C.R. 493, in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School). 192

Romer v. *Evans*, 517 U.S. 620 (1996), Supreme Court of the United States, in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School). 217

El-Al Israel Airlines v. *Danielowitz* [1992-94] Isr. L. R. 478, Supreme Court of Israel sitting as the High Court of Justice. 230

Reference questions to the Supreme Court of Canada re: same-sex marriage, 2003 253

Further Readings 257

CHAPTER 4: ASSISTED SUICIDE

Rodriguez v. *British Columbia (A.-G.)*, [1993] 3 S.C.R. 519, in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School). 259

Washington v. *Glucksberg*, 521 U.S. 702 (1997), Supreme Court of United States, in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School). 274

Further Readings 287

CHAPTER 5: JUDICIAL REASONING – SEPARATE OPINIONS

Ruth Bader Ginsburg, "Remarks on Writing Separately" (1990) 65 Wash. L. Rev. 11 in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School). 288

Antonin Scalia, "The Dissenting Opinion" [1994] J. Sup. Ct. Hist. 33 in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School). 307

William J. Brennan Jr., "In Defence of Dissents" (address given at the Third Annual Mathew O. Tobriner Lecture at the University of California, Hastings College of the Law, November 18, 1985) (transcript) (1986) 37 Hastings L.J. 427. 325

Claire L'Heureux-Dubé, "The Dissenting Opinion: Voice of the Future?" (2000) 38 Osgoode Hall L.J. 495. 328

Further Readings 347

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 6: JUDICIAL REASONING – PRECEDENT AND STARE DECISIS

Boris I Bittker, "The Bicentennial of the Jurisprudence of Original Intent the Recent Past" (1989) 77 Calif L Rev. 235 — 349

Henry Paul Monaghan, "Stare Decisis and Constitutional Adjudication" (1988) 88 Colum L Rev. 723 — 354

Jus Aharon Barak, "Overruling Precedent" (1986) 21 Isr. L. Rev. 269 — 380

Further Readings — 394

CHAPTER 7: INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTS

Betha Wilson, "Decision-Making in the Supreme Court" (1986) 36 U.T.L.J 227, 241-44. — 395

John Hagan, "Can Social Science Save Us? The Problems and Prospects of Social Science Evidence in Constitutional Litigation," In R J. Sharpe, ed., *Charter Litigation* (Toronto. Butterworths, 1987) 213; 213-19. — 398

Rules of the Supreme Court of Canada, SOR/83-74, s. 18 — 402

New *Rules of the Supreme Court of Canada*; SOR/2002-156; ss. 55-61 — 403

John C. Major, "Interveners and the Supreme Court of Canada" (1998) 8:3 National 27. — 405

Kenneth P. Swan, "Intervention and Amicus Curiae Status in Charter Litigation" in R. J. Sharpe, ed., *Charter Litigation* (Toronto: Butterworths, 1987) 27. — 406

Andrew Bernstein, "The Yoke of Canadian Egg: Corporate Standing Under the Charter" (2000) 33 Can. Bus. L.J. 247. — 416

Jacob S. Ziegel, "Merit Selection and Democratization of Appointments to the Supreme Court of Canada", in Peter Russell and Paul Howe, eds., *Choices: Courts and Legislatures* No. 5(2) (Montreal: Institute for Research on Public Policy, 1999) 2. — 433

Joseph F. Fletcher and Paul Howe, "Public Opinion and the Courts" in Peter Russell and Paul Howe, eds., *Choices: Courts and Legislatures* No. 6(3) (Montreal: Institute for Research on Public Policy, 2000) 4. — 455

Edward McWhinney, *Supreme Courts and Judicial Law-Making: Constitutional Tribunals and Constitutional Review* (Boston: M. Nijhoff, 1985), Chapter 3 — 460

Aharon Barak, *Judicial Discretion* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989), Chapter 6: Fundamental Problems in the Institutional System. 473

Further Readings 483

CHAPTER 8: JUDICIAL FREE SPEECH AND PUBLIC ATTITUDES TOWARDS THE COURT

Canadian Judicial Council, *Ethical Principles for Judges* (Ottawa: Canadian Judicial Council, 1998) 23-25, 27-33, and 37-40. 486

John Sopinka, "Must a Judge be a Monk - Revisited" (1996) 45 U.N.B. L.J. 167. 493

Kirk Makin, "Lamer Worries About Public Backlash: Angry Reaction Could Affect Judges' Decisions, Chief Justice Says" (Feb. 6, 1999) *Globe and Mail.* 498

Antonio Lamer, "Should Judges Hold Their Tongues?" (Aug. 25, 1998) *G & M* 500

Rosalie Abella, "Democracy at Work: the Case for a Strong Court" (April 13, 2000) *G & M.* 501

J. W. McClung, "Right of Reply" [letter] (Feb 26, 1999) *National Post.* 502

Shawn Ohler, "McClung's Letter Outrageous, Legal Experts Say" (Feb 27, 1999) *National Post.* 502

Jus. Michael Kirby, "Attacks on Judges: A Universal Phenomenon" (1998) 72 Aust. L. J. 599 in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School, 2000). 503

Dieter Grimm, "Under the Law: Why Judicial Ruling Merits Respect" in *Global Constitutionalism Seminar* (New Haven: Yale Law School, 2000). 518

A. Wayne MacKay, "Judicial Free Speech and Accountability: Should Judges Be Seen but Not Heard?" (1993) 3 N.J.C.L. 159. 521

Joseph F. Fletcher and Paul Howe, "Canadian Attitudes Toward the Charter and the Courts in Comparative Perspective"(2000) 6(3) *Choices* 4. 564

Lech Garlicki, "Politics and Political Independence of the Judiciary" [unpublished]. 586

Further Readings 594

CHAPTER 9: NEGATIVE AND POSITIVE RIGHTS

The Lüth Case, (1958) BverfGE 7 595

Vicki Jackson and Mark Tushnet, *Comparative Constitutional Law* (New York: Fundation Press, 1999), "Introduction to the German Abortion Decisions", 113-133. 606

Further Readings 628

JUDICIAL REASONING - PRECEDENT & STARE DECISIS
FURTHER READING

Larry Alexander, "Constrained by Precedent" (1989) 63 S Cal L Rev 1

Larry Alexander, "Bad Beginnings" (1996) 145 U. Penn L Rev. 57

Akhil Reed Amar, "On Lawson on Precedent: Response to Article by Gary Lawson" (1994) 17 Harv. J. L. Pub. Pol'y 39

Charles Cooper, "Stare Decisis: Precedent and Principle in Constitutional Adjudication" (1988) 73 Cornell L. Rev. 401.

Michael Coper, "Joint Judgments and Separate Judgments" in Tony Blackshield, Michael Coper & George Williams, eds., *The Oxford Coupanion to the High Court of Australia* (Melbourne Oxford University Press, 2001) 367.

Frank Easterbrook, "Stability and Reliability in Judicial Decisions" (1988) 73 Cornell L. Rev. 422.

Michael J. Gerhardt, "The Role of Precedent in Constitutional Decision-Making and Theory" (1991) 60 Geo. Wash. L. Rev. 68.

Mary Ann Glendon, *Rights Talk: the Impoverishment of Political Discourse* (New York: Free Press, 1991).

I Kirman, "Standing Apart to be a Part: The Precedential Value of Supreme Court Concurring Opinions" (1995) 95 Columbia L. Rev. 2083.

Gary Lawson, "Judicial Decision Making: the Role of Text, Precedent, and the Rule of Law" (1994) 17 Harv. J. L. Pub. Pol'y 23.

Alistair MacAdam & John Pyke, *Judicial Reasoning and the Doctrine of Precedent in Australia* (1998).

Harold J Spaeth and Jeffrey A Segal, *Majority Rule or Minority Will: Adherence to Precedent on the US Supreme Court* (Cambridge, NY: Cambridge University Press,1999).

Alan Thurmon, "When the Court Divides: Reconsidering the Precedential value of Supreme Court Plurality Decisions" (1992) 42 Duke L. J. 419.

INSTITUTIONAL EFFECTS
FURTHER READING

APPOINTMENTS

Henry Abraham, *Justices, Presidents and Senators: A History of the U.S. Supreme Court Appointments from Washington to Clinton*, 4th ed (Lanham Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 1999)

S.I Bushnell, "The Appointment of Judges to the Supreme Court of Canada Past, Present, and Future" in *Judicial Selection in Canada: Discussion Papers and Reports* (Canadian Association of Law Teachers Special Committee on the Appointment of Judges, 1987)

Richard Devlin, A. Wayne MacKay and Natasha Kim, "Reducing the Democratic Deficit Representation, Diversity and the Canadian Judiciary, or Towards a 'Triple P' Judiciary" (2000) 38 Alta. L. Rev. (No. 3) 734

Lee Epstein, Jack Knight & Olga Shvetsova, "The Judicial Appointments Process Comparing Judicial Selection Systems" (2001)10 Wm. & Mary Bill of Rts. J 7.

Claire L'Heureux-Dubé, "Nomination of Supreme Court Judges Some Issues for Canada" (1991) 20 Man. L. J. 600.

Roderick MacDonald and Andre Lajoie, "Auctioneers, Fence-Viewers, Popes and Judges" (1998) 9 Constit. Forum 95.

Henry Monaghan, "The Confirmation Process: Law or Politics?" (1988) 101 Harv. L. Rev. 1202

Ontario Law Reform Commission, *Appointing Judges: Philosophy, Politics, and Practice* (Toronto: Ontario Law Reform Commission, 1991).

J. E. Penner, "Common Law Cognition and Judicial Appointment" (2000) 38 Alberta L Rev. 683.

Edward Ratushny, "Confirmation hearings for Supreme Court of Canada Appointments Not a Good Idea!" in P.Thibault, B.Pelletier, L.Perret, eds., *The Challenges of Constitutionalism: Essays in Honour of Géérald-A. Beaudoin* (Montreal Les Éditions Yvon Blais, 2002) Chapter, 18.

P.H. Russell, *The Judiciary in Canada: The Third Branch of Government* (Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, 1987)

B. Wilson, "Methods of Appointment and Pluralism" in D N. Magnusson, D.A. Soberman, eds., *Canadian Constitutional Dilemmas Revisited* (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1997) 159.

EVIDENCE

Carl Baar, "Criminal Court Delay and the Charter: The Use and Misuse of Social Facts in Judicial Policy Making" (1993) 72 Can. Bar. Rev. 305.

John Hagan, "Can Social Science Save Us? The Problems and Prospects of Social Science Evidence in Constitutional Litigation" in R. J. Sharpe, ed., *Charter Litigation* (Toronto: Butterworths, 1987) 213.

Neomi Rao, "A Backdoor to Policy Making: the Use of Philosophers by the Supreme Court" (1998) 65 U. Chic. L. Rev. 1371.

STANDING

Russell Binch, "The Mere Busybody: Autonomy, Equality and Standing" (2002) 40 Alta. L. Rev. 367.

Ian C. Binnie, "Standing in Charter Cases" in G. A. Beaudoin, ed., *Charter Cases 1986-1987* (Cowansville, Quebec: Editions Yvon Blais, 1987) 77.

Sara Blake, "Standing to Litigate Constitutional Rights and Freedoms in Canada and the United States" (1984) 16 Ottawa L. Rev. 66.

Herbert Hausmaninger, "Judicial Referral of Constitutional Questions in Austria, Germany, and Russia" (1997) 12 Tul. Eur. & Civ. L.F. 25.

Richard S. Kay, "Jus Tertii Standing and Constitutional Review in Canada" (1997) 7 N.J.C.L. 129.

Patrick McCormack, "Campbell v. Louisiana - Has The Supreme Court Expanded the Doctrine of Third-Party Standing Too Far?" (1998) 29 Seton Hall L. Rev. 756.

Douglas Parker, "Standing to Litigate 'Abstract Social Interest' in the United States and Italy: Reexamining the 'Injury in Fact'" (1995) 33 Colum. J. Transnat'l L. 259.

Daniel D. Polsby, "Analysis of Judge Robert H. Bork's Opinions on Standing" (1987) 9 Cardozo L. Rev. 175

Huffman and Seathoff, "Advisory Opinions and Canadian Constitutional Development" (1990) 74 Minn. L. Rev. 1251

Alec Stone, "Abstract Constitutional Review and Policy Making in Western Europe" in Donald W. Jackson and Neal Tate, eds., *Comparative Judicial Review and Public Policy* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1992) 697

Susan D. Susman, "Distant Voices in the Courts of India: Transformation of Standing in Public Interest Litigation" (1994) 13 Wis. Int'l L. J. 57

JUDICIAL FREE SPEECH
FURTHER READING

Joseph Fletcher and Paul Howe, "Public Opinion and Canada's Courts" in Paul Howe and Peter H. Russell, eds., *Judicial Power and Canadian Democracy* (Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2001).

Martin Friedland, *A Place Apart: Judicial Independence and Accountability in Canada* (Ottawa: Canadian Judicial Council, 1995).

Ruth Bader Ginsburg, "Informing the Public about the U. S. States Supreme Court's Work" (1998) 29 Loy. U. Chic. L. J. 275.

Jus. Susan Kenny, "Maintaining Public Confidence in the Judiciary: A Precarious Equilibrium" (1999) 25 Monash U. L. Rev. 209.

Edward Ratushny, "Speaking as Judges: How Far Can They Go?" (2000) 11 N.J.C.L. 293.

Stephen Reinhardt, "Perspectives on Judicial Speech: Judicial Speech and the Open Judiciary" (1995) 28 Loy. L.A. L. Rev. 805 .

Beverley Smith, "Judicial free speech in Canada" (1996) 45 U.N.B. L.J. 161.

Jack B. Weinstein, "Lmits on Judges Learning, Speaking and Acting, Part I: How May Judges Learn" (1994) 36 Ariz. L. Rev. 539.

Jack B. Weinstein, "Limits on Judges' Learning, Speaking, and Acting: Part II Speaking and Part III Acting" (1994) 20 Dayton L. Rev. 1.

Jacob S. Ziegel, "Judicial Free Speech and Judicial Accountability: Striking the Right Balance" (1996) 45 U.N.B.L.J. 175.

NEGATIVE AND POSITIVE RIGHTS
FURTHER READING

Carl Baar, "Social Action Litigation in India: The Operation and Limits of the World's Most Active Judiciary" in Donald W. Jackson and Neal Tate, eds., *Comparative Judicial Review and Public Policy* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1992) 643.

Jamie Cassels, "Judicial Activism and Public Interest Litigation in India: Attempting the Impossible?" (1989) 37 Am. J. Comp. L. 495.

Amber Elliot, "Social Assistance and the Charter: Is there a Right to Welfare in Canada?" (2001) 7 Appeal 74.

Stepehn Holmes & Cass Sunstein, *The Cost of Rights: Why Liberty Depends on Taxes* (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1999), Chapter One: All Rights Are Positive.

Martha Jackman, "Poor Rights: Using the Charter to Support Social Welfare Claims" (1993) 19 Queen's L. J. 65.

Martha Jackman, "From National Standards to Justiciable Rights: Enforcing International Social and Economic Guarantees through Charter of Rights Review" (1999) 14 J. of L & Soc. Pol'y 69.

Wiktor Osiatynski, "Social and Economic Rights in a New Constitution for Poland" in Andras Sajo, ed., *Western Rights? Post-Communist Application* (The Hague, Netherlands: Kluwer Law International, 1996) 1485.

Dianne Pothier, "The Sounds of Silence: Charter Application Where the Legislation Declines to Speak" (1996) 7 Const'l Forum 113.

Bruce Porter, "Beyond Andrews: Substantive Equality and Positive Obligations after Eldridge and Vriend" (1998) 9 Constit. Forum 71.

Albie Sachs, "Social and Economic Rights: Can They be Made Justiciable?" (2000) 53 S.M.U. L. Rev. 1381.

Cass Sunstein, "Against Positive Rights" in Andras Sajo, ed., *Western Rights? Post-Communist Application* (The Hague, Netherlands: Kluwer Law International, 1996) 1482.